



TOLL BRIDGE PROGRAM OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE

CALTRANS BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

CONFERENCE CALL MINUTES

July 3, 2013, 4:00 PM – 5:00 PM

Attendees: TBPOC Members: Steve Heminger (Chair), Malcolm Dougherty, and Andre Boutros
PMT Members: Tony Anziano, Andrew Fremier, and Stephen Maller
Peer Review Panel Members: I. M. Idriss, J. Fisher, and F. Seible
Participants: Beatriz Lacson, Rick Land, Peter Lee, and Ashley Nguyen

Convened: 4:10 PM

Items		Action
1.	Bolt Report Draft Version 7 <ul style="list-style-type: none">The Chair noted that Draft ver. 7 of the bolt report and ver. 2 of the July 10 PowerPoint presentation have been forwarded to the TBPOC members, which each member confirmed receiving. He also indicated that he has been given the cost estimate for the saddle retrofit as \$14 million to date.The Chair welcomed the members of the Seismic Safety Peer Review Panel (SSPRP) and gave a summary where the TBPOC stood in terms of process and schedule.<ul style="list-style-type: none">The TBPOC has reviewed the 100-page report, and hopes to wrap-up today, print on Friday, and post on Monday noon.He invited the SSPRP to the BATA July 10 meeting at 10:00 AM. All three members indicated they will attend, and will plan to arrive between 8:30 AM and 9:00 AM, as requested.To the Chair's question on whether the SSPRP plans to give a presentation after the TBPOC's, F. Seible indicated it would not be necessary (the SSPRP supports the report), but would be available to answer questions.	

(Continued)

Items	Action
<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ The Chair requested SSPRP feedback on its general review of the report, especially on the rod by rod resolution table, which is preliminary pending result of the Townsend test.<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ F. Seible indicated that he agrees with the table except that he would move the 1st column of the table to the 2nd column; noted that the Executive Summary talks about safety and suggests defining safety vs. no damage/life safety (no collapse); the new bridge already meets the safety criteria, without the shear keys—it is much safer than the existing bridge and recommends moving traffic from the existing bridge to the new bridge as quickly as possible.➤ I. M. Idriss remarked that while he was initially hesitant, he is now reassured that the new bridge is much safer than the existing bridge and the sooner we get out of the existing bridge the better.➤ J. Fisher also concurred with F. Seible; sees no danger at all with opening the new bridge before retrofit is completed—the new bridge has enough load capacity and temporary supports would give added resistance.○ The Chair commented that there has been quite a bit of discussion on this subject, and noted that we need to be mindful of the TBPOC oral and written statements that the new bridge will not be opened until retrofit is complete—contrary to the SSPRP’s position; that this discussion would be null if we had stayed on schedule.<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ F. Seible reiterated that if we can move traffic today, we should do it. The bridge functions without the shear keys, which are an additional safety protection. With shims in	

(Continued)

Items	Action
<p>place and reconfirmation of the design team, opening the bridge would be in order.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Per B. Maroney, with the shims the new bridge would achieve a 1500-lifeline year criteria and would be 99% better than any bridge in California.➤ M. Dougherty noted that we are required to explain the shim, and that he agrees with the discussion thus far, which reinforces his opinion about moving traffic to the new bridge on Labor Day before retrofit is completed.➤ A. Boutros remarked that he has no issue with the technical analyses of the SSPRP, B. Maroney and M. Dougherty. He also suggested working out some strategy on how we let the public know of the provisional nature of the rod-by-rod chart pending Townsend test findings. <ul style="list-style-type: none">○ The Chair thanked F. Seible and J. Fisher for their analyses. He stated that almost three years ago, the TBPOC defined the minimum threshold for bridge opening. The TBPOC decision to open the bridge on Labor Day, through CCO 160's success included the shear key being complete. There has been much documentation about this decision to finish retrofit first. The broken bolts dealt a heavy blow to the credibility of the project. The notion of shimming and opening on Labor Day would be received poorly—the technical explanation is convincing but the environment is such that a sudden announcement of a change in direction would not win out and result in a loss of public confidence.➤ He noted that we need to be prepared if the TBPOC announces a direction consistent with the report	

(Continued)

Items	Action
<p>and the SSPRP says otherwise, and that the Committee needs to meet some more on this.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ F. Seible commented that he is addressing only the technical issue, not the public or political issue.➤ I. M. Idriss acknowledged the public perception issue, and suggested ensuring that commitment is met on whatever date is given.➤ To the Chair's query regarding the long duration of the retrofit fabrication and installation, F. Seible replied that the retrofit alternative chosen relies on several levels of post-tensioning, needs to be done in stages, and cannot be rushed.➤ Per J. Fisher, he will send his comments on the report, including issues on the total number of bolts and statement on dehumidification. <ul style="list-style-type: none">○ The Chair thanked the SSPRP members again for their participation today and their years of service to the project, and stated that their advice is valued whether the TBPOC agrees with it or not.• The SSPRP members dropped off the conference call at 4:58 PM, while the rest of the group continued with further discussion of the report.○ The Chair noted that Draft ver. 7 includes edits proposed yesterday, plus the unsolicited edits of Dr. Chung.○ In response to the Chair's query, M. Dougherty and A. Boutros indicated that they had no additional edits.<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ At M. Dougherty's request, the Chair gave a summary of the edits, and indicated that he had no additional edits himself.○ Discussion items included: SSO date to announce if not opening on Labor Day, contractor's December 10 date with caveat; posting TBPOC memo regarding	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The TBPOC unanimously APPROVED to publish Draft ver. 7 and delegated making any technical corrections to the Chair, including corrections submitted by J. Fisher. It is noted that TBPOC member M. Dougherty is on record to be in favor of opening the bridge prior to completion of the retrofit.

(Continued)

Items	Action
<p>date, media access; Plan B (in case of changing circumstances); TBPOC approval of report as is, M. Dougherty's position on opening date; deleting letter as part of report; subject of retrofit cost estimate/bridge problems (not to bring up at July 10 meeting but respond if asked).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">○ The Chair recognized the report as a good piece of work and gave the TBPOC's appreciation to the team members for their efforts.	
<p>2. POWERPOINT PRESENTATION ON JULY 10</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The Chair summarized each TBPOC member's assigned section of the presentation as follows: Slides 1 - 14, Chair, Slides 15 - 18, A. Boutros, and Slides 19 - 27, M. Dougherty.○ He reiterated that he does not like to disagree with the SSPRP, but there is both the technical and public/practical side to the bridge opening question. It is an appropriate debate to have, on technical merits alone, including public confidence in the engineering.○ The group needs to meet again to discuss the July 10 presentation and the press.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Staff to arrange a conference call tomorrow at 10:00 AM.

Adjourned: 5:49 PM

(Continued)

TBPOC CONFERENCE CALL MINUTES

July 3, 2013, 4:00 PM – 5:00 PM

APPROVED BY:



STEVE HEMINGER, TBPOC Chair
Executive Director, Bay Area Toll Authority

12/17/13
Date



Andre Boutros
Executive Director, California Transportation Commission

12/17/2013
Date



MALCOLM DOUGHERTY
Director, California Department of Transportation

12/17/13
Date